

EPPING FOREST DISTRICT COUNCIL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Committee: Area Planning Subcommittee **Date:** 10 August 2011
South

Place: Roding Valley High School, Brook Road, Loughton, Essex IG10 3JA **Time:** 7.30 - 9.25 pm

Members Present: J Hart (Chairman), K Chana, Mrs T Cochrane, R Cohen, D Dodeja, Ms J Hart, L Leonard, J Markham, G Mohindra, Mrs C Pond, Mrs P Richardson, B Sandler, P Spencer, Mrs J Sutcliffe and D Wixley

Other Councillors:

Apologies: Ms S Watson, K Angold-Stephens, R Barrett, C Finn, J Knapman, A Lion and H Ulkun

Officers Present: S Solon (Principal Planning Officer), C Neilan (Landscape Officer & Arboriculturist), P Onyia (Planning Officer), M Jenkins (Democratic Services Assistant), S G Hill (Senior Democratic Services Officer) and A Hendry (Democratic Services Officer)

17. WEBCASTING INTRODUCTION

The Chairman made a short address to remind all present that the meeting would be broadcast on the Internet, and that the Council had adopted a protocol for the webcasting of its meetings.

18. MINUTES

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the last meeting of the Sub-Committee held on 13 July 2011 be taken as read and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

19. ELECTION OF VICE-CHAIRMAN

In the absence of the Vice Chairman, the Chairman requested nominations for the role of Vice Chairman.

RESOLVED:

That Councillor K Chana be elected Vice Chairman for the duration of the meeting.

20. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

(a) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors D Dodeja, P Spencer and Mrs J Sutcliffe declared a personal interest in the following items of the

agenda, by virtue of being members of Buckhurst Hill Parish Council. The Councillors had determined that their interests were not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/1049/11 18 Brook Road, Buckhurst Hill;
- EPF/1198/11 34 Stradbroke Grove, Buckhurst Hill; and
- EPF/1242/11 63 Queens Road, Buckhurst Hill

(b) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor Mrs P Richardson declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda, by virtue of being a member of Loughton Town Council. The Councillor had determined that her interests were not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/0853/11 8 The Summit, Loughton; and
- EPF/1428/11 The Ridings, Manor Road, Loughton

(c) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors K Chana and B Sandler declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being members of Chigwell Parish Council. The Councillors had determined that their interests were not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/1273/11 93 Manor Road, Chigwell;
- EPF/1280/11 1 Gainsborough Place, Chigwell;
- EPF/0806/11 46 Dacre Gardens, Chigwell;
- EPF/0936/11 22 Coolgardie Avenue, Chigwell;
- EPF/1152/11 109 and 111 Manor Road, Chigwell; and
- EPF/1211/11 49A Hainault Road, Chigwell

(d) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor G Mohindra declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being a member of Chigwell Parish Council. The Councillor had determined that his interests were not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/1273/11 93 Manor Road, Chigwell;
- EPF/1280/11 1 Gainsborough Place, Chigwell;
- EPF/0806/11 46 Dacre Gardens, Chigwell;
- EPF/0936/11 22 Coolgardie Avenue, Chigwell; and
- EPF/1152/11 109 and 111 Manor Road, Chigwell

(e) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor G Mohindra declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being a member of Chigwell Parish Council and also knowing the neighbour to the application site concerned. The Councillor had determined that his interest was prejudicial and would leave the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/1211/11 49A Hainault Road, Chigwell

(f) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor Mrs C Pond declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being a member of Loughton Town Council. The Councillor had determined that her interest

were not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0853/11 8 The Summit, Loughton

(g) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor D Wixley declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being a Tree Warden and having met the Head Teacher of St. John's C of E Primary School, Buckhurst Hill. The Councillor had determined that his interest was not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- Agenda Item 7 EPF/07/11 St. John's C of E Primary School, and Car Park of St. John's Centenary Hall, Buckhurst Hill

(h) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor D Wixley declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being the Tree Warden and a member of Loughton Town Council. The Councillor had determined that his interest was not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0853/11 8 The Summit, Loughton

(i) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor D Wixley declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being the Tree Warden. The Councillor had determined that his interest was not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/1273/11 93 Manor Road, Chigwell;
- EPF/1280/11 1 Gainsborough Place, Chigwell;
- EPF/1428/11 The Ridings, Manor Road, Loughton; and
- EPF/0806/11 46 Dacre Gardens, Chigwell

21. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

It was noted that there was no other business for the Sub-Committee to consider.

22. CONFIRMATION OF TREE PRESERVATION ORDER EPF/07/11 - ST. JOHN'S C OF E PRIMARY SCHOOL AND CAR PARK OF ST. JOHN'S CENTENARY HALL, BUCKHURST HILL

The Sub-Committee received a report from Mr C Neilan, Tree and Landscape Officer, regarding Confirmation of Tree Preservation Order EPF/07/11, St. John's C of E Primary School, and Car Park of St. John's Centenary Hall, Buckhurst Hill.

St. John's School had approached the District Council for advice on trees within the school grounds prior to their submission of a planning application for a new classroom extension. In addition, a number of calls had been received from members of the public advising that the Church were considering plans for a new Church Hall, and concerns had been raised regarding potential loss of trees. It was appropriate to identify the most important trees in making this Tree Preservation Order.

The Grounds of Objections

One objection had been received on behalf of the Parochial Church Council and the Church Wardens. The objection related to five trees within the church car park area. The reasons given were:

- (a) It was not accepted that these trees were of any significant importance by virtue of their age, location or amenity benefit, bearing in mind the number of trees within the church grounds; and
- (b) Plans were yet to be drawn up for the new community facilities.

The Director of Planning and Economic Development commented as follows:

There were many trees on the consecrated land directly surrounding the church. These had not been included in the order due to the large number of graves within their vicinity. The trees, which were protected, were in the open area of the church car park. The volume of enquiries received, prior to making this order indicated that they had a high public amenity value. Although no application for the demolition and replacement of the existing halls had been submitted, it was premature to exclude these trees from the order on those grounds. Should such an application be received, the importance of the trees would then be considered and re-evaluated against the reasons given for the application.

RESOLVED:

That Tree Preservation Order 07/11 be confirmed without modification.

23. DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

The Sub-Committee considered a schedule of applications for planning permission.

RESOLVED:

That the planning applications numbered 1 – 11 be determined as set out in the attached schedule to these minutes.

24. DELEGATED DECISIONS

The Sub-Committee noted that schedules of planning applications determined by the Director of Planning and Economic Development under delegated authority since the last meeting had been circulated and could be inspected at the Civic Offices.

CHAIRMAN

Report Item No: 1

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0853/11
SITE ADDRESS:	8 The Summit Loughton Essex IG10 1SW
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton St Johns
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	TPO/EPF/05/93 T1 - Scots Pine - Fell
DECISION:	Granted Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniTelM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=527614

CONDITIONS

NONE

Report Item No: 2

APPLICATION No:	EPF/1273/11
SITE ADDRESS:	93 Manor Road Chigwell Essex IG7 5PN
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Grange Hill
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	TPO/EPF/30/90 T8 - Willow - Fell
DECISION:	Granted Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=529063

CONDITIONS

- 1 The work authorised by this consent shall be carried out under the direct supervision of the Local Planning Authority, who shall receive in writing, 5 working days notice of such works.
- 2 The works hereby authorised shall not be undertaken after a period of three years from the date of this consent has expired.
- 3 A replacement tree or trees, of a number, species, size and in a position as agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority, shall be planted within one month of the implementation of the felling hereby agreed, unless varied with the written agreement of the Local Planning Authority. If within a period of five years from the date of planting any replacement tree is removed, uprooted or destroyed, dies or becomes seriously damaged or defective another tree of the same species and size as that originally planted shall be planted at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.

Report Item No: 3

APPLICATION No:	EPF/1280/11
SITE ADDRESS:	1 Gainsborough Place Chigwell Essex IG7 6LA
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Chigwell Row
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	TPO/EPF/13/85 T4 - Ash - Fell
DECISION:	Granted Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/Anitelm.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=529086

CONDITIONS

- 1 The work authorised by this consent shall be carried out under the direct supervision of the Local Planning Authority, who shall receive in writing, 5 working days notice of such works.
- 2 The works hereby authorised shall not be undertaken after a period of three years from the date of this consent has expired.

Report Item No: 4

APPLICATION No:	EPF/1428/11
SITE ADDRESS:	The Ridings Manor Road Loughton Essex IG10 4RP
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	TPO/EPF/09/95 T11 - Poplar - Fell
DECISION:	Granted Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=529650

CONDITIONS

- 1 A replacement tree or trees, of a number, species, size and in a position as agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority, shall be planted and inspected and agreed to be in accordance with the details prior to implementation of the felling hereby agreed, unless varied with a written agreement of the Local Planning Authority. If within a period of five years from the date of planting any replacement tree is removed, uprooted or destroyed, or dies, or becomes seriously damaged and defective another tree of the same species and size of that originally planted shall be planted at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.

Report Item No: 5

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0806/11
SITE ADDRESS:	46 Dacre Gardens Chigwell Essex IG7 5HG
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Grange Hill
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Proposed rear two storey extension, loft conversion with two side facing dormer windows, one on each side of roof, and a front and rear dormer window.
DECISION:	Granted Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=527423

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development, shall match those of the existing building, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 3 The proposed window openings in the flank elevations at first floor level shall be fitted with obscured glass and have fixed frames to a height of 1.7 metres above the floor of the room in which the window is installed and shall be permanently retained in that condition.

Report Item No: 6

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0936/11
SITE ADDRESS:	22 Coolgardie Avenue Chigwell Essex IG7 5AY
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Chigwell Village
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	First floor side extension and loft conversion with rear dormer window.
DECISION:	Refused Permission (Householder)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=527842

Members agreed that considerable weight should be given to the impact of the proposal on light to the first floor flank windows of 20 Coolgardie Avenue and the potential for the proposal to have an overbearing relationship to that house. Members found the proposal would severely restrict light to these windows since it would be sited 1m from them and continue higher than them.

Having regard to the importance of the first floor flank windows for the living conditions of 20 Coolgardie Avenue, Members agreed that the harm that would be caused by the loss of light to those windows would be excessive. Members also agreed the harm caused outweighed any benefits for the appearance of the street scene. They considered alternative designs would achieve such design benefits without causing excessive harm to the living conditions of 20 Coolgardie Avenue.

REASON FOR REFUSAL

- 1 The proposed first floor addition, by reason of its close proximity to the boundary, its elongated high parapet and because of the overall increase in the size of its roof, will impact upon the level of light received by upper floor windows at No. 20 Coolgardie Avenue and cause overshadowing. In addition, due to the nearby proximity of the side addition to the upper floor windows, it will also result in an overbearing impact to this neighbour. This proposal therefore fails to comply with policy DBE9 of this Councils Adopted Local Plan and Alterations.

Report Item No: 7

APPLICATION No:	EPF/1049/11
SITE ADDRESS:	18 Brook Road Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5TL
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Ground and first floor side extension, two dormer windows to the front at first floor level and new entrance porch.
DECISION:	Granted Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=528256

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 No construction works above ground level shall have taken place until documentary and photographic details of the types and colours of the external finishes have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority, in writing, prior to the commencement of the development. The development shall be implemented in accordance with such approved details.

Report Item No: 8

APPLICATION No:	EPF/1152/11
SITE ADDRESS:	109 & 111 Manor Road Chigwell Essex IG7 5PS
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Grange Hill
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Minor material amendment on planning permission EPF/2462/08 (Demolition of 2 houses and construction of 13 flats) to increase rear ground and first floor building line by 2400mm and to increase building line to South-West corner up to 1000mm from boundary line.
DECISION:	Granted Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniTelM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=528616

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted shall begin no later than three years from the date of this decision.
- 2 No development shall take place until details of the materials to be used in the construction of the external surfaces of the building hereby permitted have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.
- 3 No development shall take place until details of levels have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority showing the levels of the site prior to development and proposed levels of floor slabs, roadways and access-ways and landscape areas. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.
- 4 No development shall be carried out until details of hard and soft landscaping works have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. These details shall include existing planting to be retained, species and size of new planting, hard landscaping materials, the provision of security lighting and the treatment of all boundaries. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details before any part of the building is occupied or in accordance with a programme agreed with the Local Planning Authority.
- 5 All planting shall be maintained for a period of 5 years from the date of planting. Any planting that dies, is seriously damaged or diseased or is removed within that period shall be replaced with planting of a similar species and size, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

- 6 A landscape management plan, including long term design objectives, management responsibilities and maintenance schedules for all landscape areas, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the occupation of the development. The landscape management plan shall be carried out as approved.
- 7 Prior to commencement of works on site, including those for demolition, foundations and drainage, a scheme shall be submitted for approval to the Local Planning Authority specifying the means by which those trees to be retained will be protected during the works. The approved scheme shall be implemented before commencement of the works and shall be retained for the duration of the works.
- 8 The windows in the flank walls shall be glazed with obscure glass and have fixed frames and shall be retained in that condition.
- 9 The development shall not be occupied until the car and cycle parking spaces shown on the approved drawings have been provided. The car park shall not be used other than for the parking of vehicles related to the development.
- 10 This decision is made with reference to plan numbers: 08221_105, 08221_106 and 08221_107.

Report Item No: 9

APPLICATION No:	EPF/1198/11
SITE ADDRESS:	34 Stradbroke Grove Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5PF
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Ground and first floor additions with alterations to existing flat roof. Erection of outbuilding to rear garden.
DECISION:	Granted Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniTelM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=528800

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 No construction works above ground level shall have taken place until documentary and photographic details of the types and colours of the external finishes have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority, in writing, prior to the commencement of the development. The development shall be implemented in accordance with such approved details.
- 3 Access to the rearwards flat roof hereby approved shall be for maintenance or emergency purposes only and the flat roof shall not be used as a seating area, roof garden, terrace, patio or similar amenity area. No furniture, including tables and chairs, shall be placed on the flat roof.

Report Item No: 10

APPLICATION No:	EPF/1211/11
SITE ADDRESS:	49A Hainault Road Chigwell Essex IG7 5DH
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Grange Hill
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Retention of rear conservatory extension.
DECISION:	Granted Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=528860

CONDITIONS

NONE

Report Item No: 11

APPLICATION No:	EPF/1242/11
SITE ADDRESS:	63 Queens Road Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5BU
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	New fit out of existing restaurant including remodelling of existing rear single storey extension, amended footprint and new pitched roof with rooflights.
DECISION:	Granted Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=528963

Members recognised that the outdoor area can lawfully be used for purposes in connection with the lawful use of the site as a whole. However, they agreed the proposal would facilitate a more intense use of the outdoor area and therefore agreed it is both necessary and reasonable to limit activity in that area through planning conditions. Matters to be addressed through conditions were found to include the times the outdoor area may be used, noise generated on it or audible from the extension and lighting of the outdoor area.

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 The external finishes of the development hereby permitted shall match in material, colour, style, bonding and texture those of the existing building.
- 3 Other than in the case of an emergency, the land north (rear) of the remodelled rear extension shall not be used by customers or guests between 22.00 and 08.00 the following day and the sliding folding doors of the remodelled rear extension shall be kept closed during that time.
- 4 No amplified music shall be played within the remodelled rear extension or land rear of it other than in strict accordance with a scheme submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such a scheme shall specify the times amplified music may be played, the number and location of loudspeakers and limitations on sound levels emitted from loudspeakers.
- 5 There shall be no lighting of the land north (rear) of the remodelled rear extension other than in strict accordance with a scheme submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such a scheme shall specify the times the land shall be lit, the number, location and power of light sources and include details of the means to limit light spillage beyond the land.